



Minority Coverage in Mainstream Musicological Journals, 1915–1995

INTRODUCTION

FROM THE OUTSET of Affirmative Action programs in the 1960s, advocates have sought to stem the tide perceived in the United States against women and three designated minority groups. An article on the treatment meted out to women in mainstream *Musical Quarterly*, *Journal of the American Musicological Society*, *The Journal of Musicology*, and *Current Musicology* awaits publication in another forum. The present article addresses the role of African Americans and Latin Americans in two test-case periodicals, *The Musical Quarterly* and *Journal of the American Musicological Society*. Specialized outlets are canvassed at pp. 35–41.

I AFRICAN AMERICAN COMPARED WITH LATIN AMERICAN COVERAGE IN MUSICOLOGICAL JOURNALS

When so long ago as December 29, 1936, Oliver Strunk read his historic paper entitled “The Historical Aspect of Musicology” at a joint meeting in Chicago of the Music Teachers National Association with the then two-year-old American Musicological Society, he cited as “our first and only musicological journal, *The Musical Quarterly*” (hereafter *MQ*). Another dozen years were to elapse before the maiden issue of the *Journal of the American Musicological Society* (hereafter *JAMS*), published in the Spring of 1948 began challenging *MQ*'s position as the epicenter of “our” musicology. If the articles published in these two periodicals properly serve

as bellwethers, then the proportion of Latin American versus African and African American articles appearing over a long stretch in each does tell how important the editors deemed these competing specialties to be.

So far as *MQ* is concerned, the number of articles slanted toward the competing candidates for attention remained exactly equal during the 45-year run tabulated in Herbert Goodkind's *Cumulative Index 1915 through 1959 to the Musical Quarterly*. In chronological order the eleven Latin American titles read thus:

Music in the Life of the Aztecs (1928); The First Music-Books Printed in America (1929); Types of Quechua Melody (1934); Carlos Chávez (1936); Music of Indian Mexico (1939); Silvestre Revueltas and Musical Nationalism in Mexico (1941); Drums and Drummers in Afro-Brazilian Cult Life (1944); Juan Navarro *Hispalensis* and Juan Navarro *Gaditanus* (1945); Music in Cuba, 1523–1900 (1947); Alberto Ginastera: Argentine Composer (1957); and Opera Beginnings in the New World (1959).

But in contrast with *MQ*, *JAMS* during the first 45-year span of its existence, 1948 to 1993, did not begin to welcome Latin American articles with the same hospitality accorded African and African American candidates for publication. Again, a list proves revelatory:

Richard A. Waterman's “‘Hot’ Rhythm in Negro Music” (i/1, 24–37) was embellished with nine musical examples; Rose Brandel's “Music of the Giants and Pygmies of the Belgian Congo” (v/1, 16–28) included six music examples; Brandel's “The Music of African Circumcision Rituals” (viii/1, 52–62) vaunted five examples.

Next came Robert Stevenson's “The First Black Music



Historian" (xxvi/3, 383-404); Arthur A. Moorefield's "James Bruce: Ethnomusicologist or Abyssinian Lyre" (xxvii/3, 493-514); Eileen Southern's "Musical Practices in Black Churches of Philadelphia and New York, ca. 1800-1844" (xxx/2, 296-312); Lewis Porter's "John Coltrane's A Love Supreme: Jazz Improvisation as Composition" (xxxviii/3, 593-622) with 19 examples; and Scott DeVeaux's "Bebop and the Recording Industry: the 1942 AFM Recording Ban Reconsidered" (xli/1, 126-165).

Against these eight African and African American inclusions, Latin American music history rated a mere three: all by a single author, Robert Stevenson.

"The First Dated Mention of the Sarabande" (v, 29-31); "The Bogotá Music Archive" (xv/3, 292-315); and "The First New World Composers: Fresh Data from Peninsular Archives" (xxiii/1, 95-106).

After 1970, nothing historical emerged. However in tribute to a contemporary pop icon, Don Michael Randel did publish in the Summer 1991 issue "Crossing Over with Rubén Blades" (xliv/2, 301-323).

Born at Panama City July 16, 1948, Rubén Blades journeyed to New York City in 1970, henceforth developing a multiple career that included graduation from Harvard Law School (the ceremony being recorded in a 1986 British television documentary, *The Return of Ruben Blades*). Randel's article appeared after Blades's winning of two Grammy awards. Entering politics, Blades vehemently criticized the U.S. invasion of Panama December 20, 1989. In 1994 he ran unsuccessfully for president of Panama. His entry in *The Guinness Encyclopedia of Popular Music* (1992), I, 261, vouches for his gilt-edged international renown.

As if rejecting Latin American historical articles were not sufficiently symptomatic, *JAMS*'s reviews editors also cold-shouldered the area. True, two books by one author were indeed reviewed in *JAMS*: *Music in Mexico A Historical Survey, 1952* (viii [1955], 48-50) and *The Music of Peru Aboriginal and Viceroyal Epochs, 1960* (xvi [1963], 397-399). But after these, neither the same author's 419-page *Renaissance and Baroque Musical Sources in the Americas* (Washington, D.C.: General Secretariat, Organization of American States, 1970), selling for \$5,¹ nor 300-page *Foundations of New World Opera*

with a transcription of the earliest extant American opera (Lima: Ediciones Cvltrva, 1973), nor his *Christmas Music from Baroque Mexico* (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1974) earned a review in *JAMS* (or, for that matter, in any crucial USA scholarly periodical). His edition, prefaced by a lengthy bilingual prologue, of Tomás de Torrejón y Velasco's *La púrpura de la rosa* [1701] (Lima: Instituto Nacional de Cultura, 1976; 139 + 19 pp. [introduction], 145 pp. [music score]) similarly escaped review.²

as a trial edition, awaits a second improved edition now ready for publication. Although not reviewed in a USA learned journal, Gerard Béhague provided the *Handbook of Latin American Studies (HLAS)*, no. 36 (Gainesville: University of Florida Press, 1974), p. 480, with a summary and evaluation of its 346 pages of text, that are followed by a 72-page appendix of musical excerpts drawn by Cootje Franken (of Montevideo, Uruguay).

Archival materials not inventoried in *RBMSA*, but later noticed by its author include Caribbean sources itemized in his *A Guide to Caribbean Music History: bibliographic supplement to a paper read at the 1975 Annual Meeting of the Music Library Association in San Juan, Puerto Rico* (Lima: Cvltrva, 1975; 101 pages; reviewed in *Heterofonia*, 9/47, 1976, pp. 22-23); sources at Caracas, Lima, and Rio de Janeiro in "South American National Library Publications," *Notes of the Music Library Association*, 35/1 (1978), pp. 31-41, and in a revised, amplified version as "National Library publications in Brazil, Peru, and Venezuela," *Inter-American Music Review (IAMR)*, 3/1 (Fall 1980), pp. 39-48; Venezuelan sources in "La música en la Catedral de Caracas hasta 1836," *Revista Musical Chilena (RMCh)*, 33/145 (January-March 1979), pp. 48-114; and Puebla materials in "Sixteenth- through Eighteenth-Century Resources in Mexico: Part III," *Fontes artis musicae*, 1987/2, pp. 156-187.

Working from microfilm, the brilliant researcher Paul W. Borg in "The Jacaltenango miscellany: a revised catalogue," *IAMR*, 3/1 (Fall 1980), pp. 55-64, identified works by Loyset Compère and Rodrigo de Ceballos, and provided concordances with numerous other manuscript sources. His epoch-making "The Polyphonic Music in Guatemalan Music Manuscripts of the Lilly Library," Indiana University Ph.D. dissertation, 1985 (2 vols., 666 pp.), superseded everything published in *RBMSA*, pages 61-62, concerning Santa Eulalia M. Md. 1-5, 7, San Juan Ixcoi, and San Mateo Ixtatán manuscript materials.

²Availing himself of a microfilm of MS C1469 in the Biblioteca Nacional at Lima, without recourse to the manuscript itself, Martin Cunningham provided a fresh transcription of the music in Pedro Calderón de la Barca, Tomás de Torrejón y Velasco, *La púrpura de la rosa, Edición del texto de Calderón y de la música de Torrejón comentados y anotados por Ángeles Cardona, Don Cruickshank y Martin Cunningham* (Kassel: Edition Reichenberger, 1990 [Teatro del Siglo de Oro, Ediciones críticas 9]), pp. 340-451. The Bodleian Library, Oxford, MS Add. A.143 contains a 1662 version of the text, but lacks music.

¹ Reproduced from Goldye Oberwager's typescript generated at the Central Stenographic Bureau, University of California, Los Angeles (henceforth UCLA), *Renaissance and Baroque Musical Sources in the Americas (RBMSA)*, originally intended



II CHARLES SEEGER'S PUISSANT VOICE

Some sort of explanation for this anomaly must be at least hazarded. Speaking beyond the grave, Charles Seeger (*b* Mexico City, December 14, 1886; *d* Bridgewater, Connecticut, February 7, 1979)—“musicologist, composer, conductor, critic, and musical philosopher”—still tells his listeners why they should disregard Latin America’s historic patrimony. Hailed by H. Wiley Hitchcock on the back jacket of Seeger’s *Studies in Musicology II, 1924–1979* (University of California Press, 1994) as “twentieth-century America’s most magisterial musicologist—by which I mean the most wide-ranging, deep-digging, horizon-expanding, and intellectually awesome musical thinker we have had,” Charles Seeger nonetheless consistently forfended those who heard him from giving any serious attention to even the rich art-music legacy of the nation that during Porfirio Díaz’s epoch provided his entrepreneurial father with the financial bonanzas that enabled Charles and his brother Alan (1888–1916) to study at costly Hackley School and Harvard. In *Notes of the Music Library Association*, sec. ser., x/2 (March 1953), 250, Charles classed “the fine art of music in Mexico” as

for the most part stumbling, mongrel, epigonic, and inept. Only a few works, and those very recent, can stand beside the best works of the big world except to disadvantage. But what of the popular music of Mexico? These are indeed pearls! And they can stand beside their fellows in any American or European country, if they do not actually stand above them.

At the time that he published this damning assessment of the “fine art of music in Mexico,” Seeger still headed the Music Division of the Pan American Union (name changed in 1948 to the Organization of American States) headquartered at Washington, D.C. From volumes 9 through 16 of the *Handbook of Latin American Studies* (1943 through 1950), edited at the Library of Congress, he had supplied annotations of current Latin American music publications. For art-music entries—even Carlos Chá-

vez’s *Sinfonía india* (New York: G. Schirmer’s Study Scores of Orchestral Works and Chamber Music, no. 56 [82 pp])—he had supplied such a curt dismissal as this: “For concert use. Composed in New York, 1935–1936.” But in the same volume, he had reserved a lengthy panegyric for so avowedly folkloric an item as Fernando Ortiz’s *La africanía de la música folklórica de Cuba* (Havana: Ministerio de Educación, Dirección de Cultura, 1950).

Even after forced premature departure from the OAS,³ Seeger’s mind-set concerning pre-1908 Western Hemisphere art-music did not waver. The *Report of the Eighth Congress of the International Musicological Congress New York 1961*, Volume 1—*Papers*, edited by Jan LaRuc, page 365, documents his continued adverse judgment:

During the four centuries 1500–1900, even the few outstanding written compositions lie far below the run-of-the-mill production of Europe contemporary with them. It is possible that a few figures, such as Louis Moreau Gottschalk, Carlos Gomes, and Edward MacDowell, might have received passing notice had they lived in Europe instead of Brazil and the United States.

³ Ann M. Pescatello, *Charles Seeger A Life in American Music* (Pittsburgh and London: University of Pittsburgh Press, 1992), 325–326, lists Seeger’s contributions under a pseudonym to the Communist front New York *Daily Worker* in 1934–1935. She summarizes thus (p. 125): “Seeger’s writings for the *Daily Worker* were uneven, sometimes the work of a professional scholar, sometimes the writing of a hack Marxist propagandist, in accord with a theme of Communist thought of the time . . .”. She discusses his exit from the Organization of American States (OAS) at pages 208–209 and 306. On being questioned by the FBI, Seeger recalled having said: “I am willing to undress, figuratively speaking, myself, but I will not tell you anything about anyone else.” His son, Peter, was at that time a professed Communist party member.

See also David K. Dunaway, “Charles Seeger and Carl Sands: The Composers’ Collective Years,” *Ethnomusicology*, 24/2 (May 1980), pp. 159–160: “In 1934 and ’35, Seeger adopted the nom-de-plume Carl Sands to write what he called ‘affective’ music criticism for the *Daily Worker*. The overall goal of the Collective was to create a new music, simultaneously revolutionary in content and form, which would inspire class struggle and uplift the musical tastes of American workers.” Seeger’s three-part round at page 166 sets a doggerel by Fred Rolland: “Oh joy upon the earth, to live and see the day / When Rockefeller senior, shall up to me and say, / Comrade, can you spare a dime.”

Seeger’s range of an eleventh contrasts with the mere octave or ninth required in “Three Blind Mice,” “Row, row, row your boat,” and “Are you sleeping”—perhaps explaining why the doggerel music never caught on, even as a vehicle for Seeger’s beloved class struggle.

The Lima copyist used the Vera Tassis 1687 *Tercera parte de comedias* for the text of the 783 verses in Lima MSC1469. Cunningham agrees that the other 672 verses in the Vera Tassis text were probably sung (*ibid.*, p. 305). Like the Stevenson 1976 Biblioteca Nacional publication, the Kassel Reichenberger xvi + 540-page volume has been ignored by USA musicological journals.



As if no one had reminded him in the meantime that all three—Gottschalk, Gomes, and MacDowell—had indeed lived long and successfully in Europe, Seeger allowed the same pontifical utterance to reappear intact in his *Studies in Musicology, 1935–1975* (University of California Press, 1977), page 196.⁴

Not that intervening years had denied him an opportunity to hear first-rate performances of early Mexican and South American “fine-art” music, had he so desired. Between April 20–30, 1961, Roger Wagner had conducted in Schoenberg Hall, University of California, Los Angeles, “magesterial, deep-digging, horizon-expanding, and intellectually awesome” first performances in the United States of compositions by Hernando Franco (1532–1585), Juan Gutiérrez de Padilla (ca. 1590–1664), Manuel de Zumaya = Sumaya (ca. 1680–1755); and Juan de Lienas, all four active in Seeger’s natal nation (in addition, Wagner had premiered four viceregal South American works). In 1966 Angel had released to Martin Bernheimer’s acclaim Roger Wagner’s first of an eventual series of five LPs containing pre-1750 Latin American masterpieces.⁵

III FRANCISCO CURT LANGE’S PIONEER PUBLICATIONS

Although none in the United States dared oppose Seeger’s fiat while he continued heading the PAU-

⁴ In her Charles Seeger article for *The New Grove Dictionary of American Music* (1986), iv, 181, Pescatello dates his sojourn at Cologne 1910–1911. In her introduction to his *Studies in Musicology II* (1994), page 2, she extends his European period to “several years,” “spent above all [in] Germany and France. There he met many of the rising stars in the composition world and did a considerable amount of composing himself.” In his *Reminiscences of an American Musicologist* (University of California, Los Angeles, Oral History Program, 1972), p. 2, he recalled having heard nothing in Mexico except “the popular music of Mexico.”

⁵ Lester D. Brothers’s “Baroque Music in Mexico performed by the A Cappella Choir of UCLA conducted by Roger Wagner,” *Latin American Music Review (LAMR)*, 5/2 (Fall/Winter 1984), 293–305, contains a chronological list of the LPs issued under UCLA Latin American Center auspices up through 1983: (1) *Salve Regina: Choral Music of the Spanish New World [1550–1750]*, Angel Records S36008 (1966); (2) *Festival of Early Latin American Music* performed by the Roger Wagner Chorale and Sinfonia Chamber Orchestra, Eldorado Records 1 (1975); (3) *Latin American Musical Treasures from the Sixteenth, Seventeenth, and Eighteenth Centuries* [same forces], Eldorado

Music Division, one musicologist of German birth who at age 27 had chosen South America as his base of operations—Francisco Curt (Franz Kurt) Lange (b. Ellenberg, Prussia, December 12, 1903; emigrated in 1930 to Montevideo, Uruguay)—had in April 1935 inaugurated a series of six monumental volumes (published annually 1935 through 1938, in 1941 and 1946) called collectively *Boletín Latino-Americano de Música*, that in nearly every issue had called into question Seeger’s damaging dogmas.

However, only a few United States libraries subscribed to the series, and readers in the few libraries usually found Spanish and Portuguese to be uncomfortable obstacles. Because the circulation throughout North America was so limited, a trial list—this one of *Boletín* articles still permanently worthy of respect—deserves scanning:

Volume I (Montevideo, 1935) contained Carlos Isamitt’s “Un instrumento araucano—La Trutruka”⁶ (pp. 43–46); Andrés Sas’s “Ensayo sobre la música inca” (pp. 71–77), and Luiz Heitor Corrêa de Azevedo’s⁷ “José Mauricio Nunes Garcia” (pp. 133–150)

Volume II (Lima, 1936) included as its lengthiest essay Carlos Raygada’s⁸ “Panorama musical del Perú” (pp. 169–214)

2 (1977); (4) *Baroque Music in Mexico* performed by the A Cappella Choir of UCLA conducted by Roger Wagner. Eldorado 3 (1983). In 1987 *Baroque Music in South America*, Eldorado 4, concluded the series. Brothers lists alphabetically under composer all items in 1966–1983 releases.

⁶ John M. Schechter’s valuable illustrated article, *New Grove Dictionary of Musical Instruments*, 3 (1984), 658, identifies the compass of the end-blown, vertical tube, excessively long trutruka played by the Mapuche in southern Chile as 13 pitches. Concerning the trutruka, see also Luis Merino, “Instrumentos musicales, cultura Mapuche, y el *Cautiverio Feliz* del Maestro de Campo Francisco Núñez de Pineda y Bascañan,” *RMCh*, 28/128 (October–December 1974), 73–74. This pathbreaking article should be Englished for publication in *Ethnomusicology* or *IAMR*.

⁷ His obituary in *IAMR*, “Luiz Heitor Corrêa de Azevedo (1905–1992),” xiii/2 (Spring–Summer 1993), 166–167, cites his birth at Rio de Janeiro December 13, 1905, and death at Paris November 10, 1992, thereafter tracing the chief events of his career as they unfold in the *Enciclopédia da música brasileira: erudita, folclórica e popular (EMB)* (São Paulo: Art Editora, 1977), I, 429, under the heading “Luis Heitor.”

⁸ Author of a two-volume *Historia crítica del Himno Nacional* (Lima: J. Mejía Baca & P. L. Villaneuva, 1954) and an incomplete posthumous *Guía Musical del Perú* serialized in *Fénix*, Nos 12, 13, and 14, Lima, 1956–1957, 1963, and 1964 (pp. 5–27, 1–82, 3–95), Carlos Raygada (Lima, February 3, 1898; February 7, 1953) wrote extensively for *El Comercio* after 1934,



Volume III (Montevideo, 1937) contained Corrêa de Azevedo's "Carlos Gomes: Sua verdadeira posição no quadro de Ópera Italiana no séc. XIX e na evolução da música brasileira" (pp. 83–87)

Volume IV (Bogotá, 1938) paid tribute to South American music history with José Ignacio Perdomo Escobar's⁹ lavishly illustrated "Esbozo histórico sobre la música colombiana" (pp. 387–570); Edmund J. Favaro's detailed "Ensayo histórico sobre los antecedentes del Himno nacional del Uruguay" (pp. 571–634); and two Lange monographs, "Guillermo Uribe Holguín" (pp. 757–795) and "El compositor argentino Juan Carlos Paz" (pp. 799–829)

Volume V (Montevideo, October 1941) enlisting Charles Seeger's advice¹⁰ offered Melville J. Herskovits's "El estudio de la música negra en el hemisferio occidental" (pp. 133–142); William Russell's "Aspectos técnicos del jazz" (pp. 337–345); and two articles by Vicente T. Mendoza,¹¹ "La Canción de Mayo en México" (pp. 491–514) and "El álbum de 24 canciones y jarabes mexicanos" (pp. 515–541)

Volume VI, part I (Rio de Janeiro, April 1946)—which concluded the series—contains Lange's "La música en Minas Gerais: Un informe preliminar" (pp. 409–499), Heitor Villa-Lobos's "Educação musical" (pp. 495–588) and "Oscar Lorenzo Fernández" (pp. 589–593).¹²

With this publication record, Lange had established himself as the one musicologist in Latin America not to be ignored—even by Seeger. In a 513-page exhaustively indexed UCLA Oral History

product, "Reminiscences of an American musicologist" (1972; transcriptions by Adelaide G. Tusler [1966] and Ann M. Briegleb [1970–1971], page 397, Seeger delivered this thrust:

[Lange] had founded an institute in Montevideo and had started publishing an annual Boletín [Latino-Americano de Música]. . . . So I got Lange on as a consultant and set him down to the desk in my nice little office and set him to work. He didn't do a damn thing but denounce me. . . . Well, of course, that sort of thing never succeeds.

Seeger at once summarily dismissed Lange.¹³ But if he had nothing good to say of Lange, he equally distanced himself from the Colombian conductor, Guillermo Espinosa (*b* Cartagena, January 9, 1905; *d* Washington, D.C., July 5, 1990), who succeeded him as Chief after his departure in February 1953.

Meanwhile there'd been some finagling on the outside on the part of a more or less exiled Colombian musician, Guillermo Espinosa, who was an intriguer like Lange. . . . I talked it over with [Alberto] Lleras [Colombian Secretary-General of the OAS], and Lleras said he would like to have Espinosa appointed [to an assistantship in Seeger's division]. So I said, "Well, if you recommend your countryman so strongly, I'll be very pleased to accept him." Disregarding the barb, Lleras very gratefully appointed Espinosa, and he took his office.

IV ROBERT JOSEPH SNOW'S CONTRIBUTIONS

The long term ruling of the Latin American musical domain by "America's most magisterial musicologist" assumes crucial relevance in an aperçu such as the present window. Withstanding Seeger's thrusts, the sole scholar reaching retirement age in the 1990's has been Robert Joseph Snow. Seeger knew Steven Barwick's seminal Harvard University 1949 two-volume dissertation, "Sacred vocal polyphony in early colonial Mexico," as he did also Alice E. Ray's University of Southern California 1953 Ph.D. dissertation, "The Double-Choir Music of Juan de Padilla: Seventeenth-Century Composer in

held numerous bureaucratic posts culminating in an appointment at the Peruvian Embassy in Rome (1951–1952), and earned an entry in Alberto Tauro's *Enciclopedia Ilustrada del Perú*, 5 (1987), 1764.

⁹ *IAMR*, III/1 (1980), 117–118, contains Perdomo Escobar's obituary reprinted from *El Tiempo* (Bogotá), May 1 and 13, 1980. For a list of his multiple honors and publications, see Darío Jaramillo Agudelo's *presentación* in Egberto Bermúdez's catalogue of the *Colección de instrumentos musicales José Ignacio Perdomo Escobar* (Bogotá: Banco de la República, Biblioteca Luis Ángel Arango, 1986), p. 3. He began instrument collecting in 1938, while secretary of the national Conservatorio de Música.

¹⁰ For Lange's lifetime assessment, see his "Charles Seeger and *Americanismo Musical* (remembrance)," *IAMR*, I/2 (1979), 245–251.

¹¹ Gabriel Moedano M.'s *La vida y la obra de Vicente T. Mendoza, 1894–1964* (Mexico City: Secretaría de Educación Pública, 1976), has been superseded by Clara Meierovich's critical biography (1995) stressing his unfulfilled ambition to be known as a composer.

¹² Villa-Lobos's falling out with Lange resulted in the cancellation of Part 2 of Volume VI.

¹³ Lange next settled at Mendoza, Argentina, where in 1948 he established a musicology department at the Universidad Nacional de Cuyo—there founding and editing a *Revista de estudios musicales* (1949–1954) that persisted through three volumes (with a supplement to Vol. 1).



Mexico." But only Snow obtained microfilms of the cathedral choirbooks giving rise to their dissertations. Snow alone recognized that although Seeger was born at Mexico City and spent crucial years in Mexico 1902 to 1904, none of his writings shows any more familiarity with Spanish, Portuguese, or Latin American Renaissance and Baroque music than do the effusions of a fellow opinionated New Englander, John Sullivan Dwight. Not only did Snow obtain Mexican microfilms, but also microfilms from Bogotá, Guatemala, Oaxaca, and abundantly from Spain—possession of which necessarily precluded transcription and evaluation. Because he possessed them, Snow's definitive 155-page monograph, *The Extant Music of Rodrigo de Ceballos and its sources* (Detroit: Information Coordinators, 1980) could reveal such news as this: seven of Ceballos's Magnificats at Bogotá are *unica*. After his serendipitous recovery at Ronda, Spain, of Juan de Esquivel Barahona's 593-page liturgical omnigatherum entitled . . . *Psalmorum, hymnorum, magnificarum et B. Mariae quatuor antiphonarum de tempore, necnon et missarum Tomus Secundus* (Salamanca: Francisco de Cea Tesa, 1613), the approbation of which was signed December 7, 1611, by Vicente Espinel at Madrid, Snow could correct Felipe Pedrell.¹⁴

In his *The 1613 Print of Juan Esquivel Barahona* (Detroit: Information Coordinators, 1978) containing music examples at pages 39–88, Snow with his usual acuity could identify two of the seven masses in the 1613 print—*Quasi cedrus* and *Hortus conclusus*, both *a 4*—as being parodies of Marian motets. Guerrero's *Sacrae cantiones* (Seville: Martín de Montedoca, 1555)¹⁵ and Rodrigo de Ceballos's widely extant motet supplied the parody sources. Snow connects Esquivel with Mexico when at page 94 he alludes to the manuscript copy of Esquivel's *Missa Ductus est Jesus* in the so-called Canon Octaviano Valdés codex¹⁶ (inventoried by Robert Steven-

son in *Fontes artis musicae*, 1955/i, 12–13, and more correctly in *Renaissance and Baroque Musical Sources in the Americas*, pages 131–132).

Still more relevant to Mexico than any of Snow's publications mentioned in the preceding paragraph is his admirable edition of Gaspar Fernandes's *Obras sacras* (Lisbon: Fundação Calouste Gulbenkian, Serviço de Música, 1990). Only a scholar of Snow's stature could have convicted Fernandes of erroneously crediting to Guerrero the Rodrigo de Ceballos *Vexilla regis prodeunt* hymn portion arranged and augmented by Fernandes (copied into the Oaxaca Cathedral codex at folios 16^v–17). Snow's familiarity with Guerrero's entire output enabled him to identify among "nearly 200 works" in Guatemala Cathedral choirbooks I, II and III, and more recently discovered IV, "thirty compositions by Francisco Guerrero, almost all of which are preserved only in these sources or are distinctly different versions of works that appear in one or another of the prints preserving his music."

There are eighteen Vespers hymns, seven settings of the Magnificat, a setting of the sequence for Easter Sunday, one of the Lamentations of Jeremiah as sung in most Spanish dioceses¹⁷ as the first lessons of Matins on Holy Thursday prior to the introduction into Spain of the 1568 Breviary of Pius V, two alternation settings of *Salve Regina*, and part of the earlier [1566] version of the *Missa pro defunctis*.

The article announcing these discoveries, "Music by Francisco Guerrero in Guatemala," published in *Nassarre Revista Aragonesa de Musicología*, III/1

¹⁴Felipe Pedrell, *Diccionario biográfico y bibliográfico de músicos y escritores de música españoles, portugueses e hispano-americanos antiguos y modernos: acopio de documentos para servir á la historia del arte musical en nuestra nación* (Barcelona: Tip. de V. Berdós y Feliu, 1894–1897), Esquivel entry.

¹⁵Klaus Wagner, *Martín de Montedoca y su prensa: Contribución al estudio de la imprenta y de la bibliografía sevillanas del siglo XVI* (Seville: Universidad de Sevilla, 1982), 70–72, 114–115 (printing contract dated August 23, 1555), 146–148 (facsimiles).

¹⁶Born at Cacamalocán, Mexico, March 21, 1901, Octaviano Valdés proceeded doctor of theology (1923) and of philosophy (1924) at the Pontifical Gregorian University in Rome. He

became a Mexico City Cathedral canon in 1951 and in 1976 dean (*Enciclopedia de México*, XIV [1988], 7941). Concerning Esquivel's presence in the Valdés Codex, see "Spanish Polyphonists in the Age of the Armada," *IAMR*, XII/2 (Spring–Summer 1992), 105. First published in 1608, Esquivel's four-voice *Missa Ductus est Jesus* copied at folios 27^v–36 in the Valdés Codex forces the belief that this manuscript was copied after the "1599. Años," date written in the upper right hand corner of folio 87; see *IAMR* XII/2 (Spring–Summer 1992), 105, note 138.

¹⁷In Jane Morlet Hardie's exhaustively researched "Lamentations in Spanish sources before 1568: Notes towards a geography," *Actas del XV Congreso de la Sociedad Internacional de Musicología . . . Madrid 3–10/IV/1992*, Vol. 2, published in the *Revista de Musicología*, XVI/2 (1993), 912–942, she distinguished between the ordering of Lamentation texts in Pius V's breviary and the sequence of Lamentation texts accepted in 23 different Spanish locales for use on Wednesday, Thursday, and Friday nights of Holy Week. See her Table III, page 937, for Sevillian usage before 1510.



(1987), 153–202, was preceded by Snow's paper on the same subject, read at the Fifth Session (November 23, 1986) of the *Congreso Internacional "Música Española del Renacimiento."* Melchior Robledo (+ 1586) in *Memoriam*, held at Saragossa November 21–23, 1986.

Only a liturgist with Snow's expertise could have assembled all the minute detail concerning hymns, sequences, antiphons, and lamentations that ornament his other profound monographs and articles. His erudition also informs his reviews, an example being his comments on Dieter Lehnhoff's *Música de la época colonial en Guatemala. Primera antología* (Antigua Guatemala: Centro de Investigaciones Regionales Mesoamericanas, 1984) reviewed in the Spring–Summer 1985 issue of Gerard Béhague's *Latin American Music Review*, pages 108–113.

V PRESENT PRIME OUTLETS FOR LATIN AMERICAN MUSICAL SCHOLARSHIP

To the *Latin American Music Review* published by the University of Texas Press since its inaugural Spring/Summer 1980 number (two issues each year) and to the dean of uninterrupted South American musicological journals, *Revista Musical Chilena (RMCh)*, the first number of which appeared in May 1945, continue repairing searchers for reviews of indispensable Latin American publications. Between 1945 and 1985, *RMCh* included 54 reviews of items focused on Latin America. Luis Merino Montero, illustrious editor of *RMCh* since 1973, wrote 12 reviews, Inés Grandela of the University of Chile's Facultad de Artes provided 10 reviews, as did also Samuel Claro Valdés; Robert Stevenson contributed 14.

Because *RMCh*'s subscribers throughout South America frequently lack access to large libraries, *RMCh* reviewers have on occasion provided overviews of the contents of reviewed matter. *Inter-American Music Review (IAMR)* in its two issues each year since Fall of 1978 has also followed suit, the editor not disdaining to provide summaries of difficult-of-access material. On the other hand, *LAMR* reviewers usually forgo descriptions of contents. One example among many: Anthony Seeger could begin his review in *LAMR*, v/1 (Spring/Summer 1984), 108–112, of "A Paradigmatic Test of Acculturation," an essay by Charles Lafayette Boi-

les¹⁸ occupying pages 53–78 in *Cross-cultural perspectives on Music* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1982), with the assumption that readers not yet owning "this excellent volume, originally intended to honor Mieczslaw Kolinski" would nonetheless have access to it. A representative catena of subsequent invaluable *LAMR* reviews defines acquisitions that no USA university library should forgo.

LAMR, v/2 (Fall/Winter 1984), 271–286.

Antonio Alexandre Bispo¹⁹ provided a palmary traversal of *Die Musikkulturen Lateinamerikas im 19.*

¹⁸Charles L. Boilès (1932–1984), who died at Montreal December 17, 1984, was recalled in Marcia Herndon's "In Memoriam," *Ethnomusicology*, 30/2 (Spring/Summer 1986), 277–280, with an obituary that included a bibliography of his writings prepared by J. J. Nattiez. After receiving his Ph.D. at Tulane University in 1969—Gilbert Chase having supervised his dissertation, "Cognitive Process in Otomi Cult Music" (iv + 176 pp.; University Microfilms 70-06,380; *Dissertation Abstracts*, xxx.10, p. 4470-B), Boilès taught at Indiana University 1969–1976, in July of 1976 accepting a teaching post at the University of Montreal.

¹⁹Antonio Alexandre Bispo, author of the 1979 Cologne University dissertation, *Die katholische Kirchenmusik in der Provinz São Paulo zur Zeit des brasilianischen Kaiserreiches* (Regensburg: Gustav Bosse, 1981) and of *Grundlagen christlicher Musikkultur in der aussereuropäischen Welt der Neuzeit: der Raum des früheren portugiesischen Patronatsrechts* (Cologne/Rome: Institut für hymnologische und musiktechnologische Studien: Consociatio Internationalis Musicae Sacrae, 1988), listed the "most praiseworthy studies of Brazilian 19th-century music" in notes 6 and 8 accompanying his article, "O Século XIX na Pesquisa Histórico-Musical Brasileira: Necessidade de sua Reconsideração," *LAMR*, 2/1 (Spring–Summer 1981), 140–141.

Born at São Paulo in 1949, he studied architecture at the Universidade de São Paulo, and composition and conducting at the Instituto Musical in São Paulo. Under auspices of this institute's Centro de Pesquisas de Música Brasileira he conducted performances of works by various neglected nineteenth-century São Paulo composers—among them Elias Álvares Lobo (1834–1901) and Manoel dos Passos. Lengthy research in nine Brazilian states between 1969 and 1974 and in 1978 preceded his doctoral dissertation. (*LAMR*, 2/1, p. 142).

Upon completing his doctorate, he joined the ethnomusical section of the Institut für Hymnologische und Musikethnologische Studien E.V. in Maria Laach. His articles range from "Kirchenmusik und Kulturfragen in Brasilien," *Kirchenmusikalisches Jahrbuch*, 70 (1986), 123–141, to "A Schola Cantorum Coloniensis," *Canto Gregoriano: órgão do Instituto Gregoriano de Lisboa*, 23, No. 94 (1980), 13–18. He edited the first volume of the *Boletim da Sociedade Brasileira de Musicologia* (São Paulo, 1983), to which he contributed the article, "Tendências e perspectivas da musicologia no Brasil," pp. 13–52.

For aperçus of six of Bispo's publications, see *HLAS*, no. 46 (1984), items 7054–7057, and no. 48 (1986), items 7003 and 7047.



Jahrhundert, Studien zur Musikgeschichte des 19. Jahrhunderts, 57, edited by Robert Günther (Regensburg: Gustav Bosse, 1982), 464 pp., bibliographies, music examples, illustrations, name index.

LAMR, vi/2 (Fall/Winter 1985), 282–292.

Rui Vieira Nery²⁰ documented additional Italian operatic sources in his review of Gerhard Doderer, ed., *Modinhas Luso-Brasileiras. Portugaliae Musica*, xlv (Lisbon: Fundação Calouste Gulbenkian, 1984), xxix + [5] + 145 pp.; introductory study (Portuguese and English), Revisionsbericht, facsimiles, transcriptions.

LAMR, vii/2 (Fall/Winter 1986), 347–358.

Alejandro Enrique Planchart²¹ insightfully reviewed both Walter Guido, *José Ángel Lamas y su época* (Caracas: Biblioteca Ayacucho, 1981), 15 + (102) pp.; and Miguel Castillo Didier, *Juan Bautista Plaza: Una vida por la música y por Venezuela. Ensayo de biografía documental*, Presentación by Nolita de Plaza and José Vicente Torres. Colección Investigaciones 4. (Caracas: Instituto Latinoamericano de Investigaciones y Estudios Musicales Vicente Emilio Sojo, 1985), 564 pp.

LAMR, viii/2 (Fall/Winter 1987), 269–292.

Denominated a “review-essay,” this survey and cri-

tique provided by Esperanza Pulido and Juan José Escorza, takes valiantly into account five volumes of history and one of bibliography collectively entitled *La música de México*, Julio Estrada, editor (Mexico City: Instituto de Investigaciones Estéticas, Universidad Autónoma de México, 1984–1986). The most extended attempt yet made to cover the entirety of any Latin American nation’s musical history, the five volumes cover the following periods: (1) *Prehispánico* (ca. 1500 B.C.E. to 1521 C.E., 235 pp.); (2) *Virreinal* (1500–1810, 182 pp.); (3) *Independencia a la Revolución* (1810–1910, 212 pp.); (4) *Nacionalista* (1910–1958, 170 pp.); (5) *Contemporáneo* (1958–1980, 235 pp.). The nonpareil erudition of the reviewers results in more trustworthy information than inhabits most of the volumes reviewed. This review should indeed serve as the starting pad on which any newcomer to Mexican music history commences his/her run.

LAMR, xii/2 (Fall/Winter 1991), 200–204.

With his customary perceptivity, Gerard Béhague pays tribute to Juan Carlos Estenssoro’s *Música y Sociedad Coloniales. Lima 1680–1830* (Lima: Editorial Colmillo Blanco, 1989), 159 pp.

²⁰Nery’s palmary publications include *Para a história do barroco musical português; o Códice 8942 da Biblioteca Nacional de Lisboa* (Lisbon: Fundação Calouste Gulbenkian, 1980); *A música no ciclo da “Bibliotheca Lusitana”* (same publisher, 1984); *História da música* (in collaboration with Paulo Ferreira de Castro) (Lisbon: Comissariado para a Europalia 91-Portugal [Imp. Nacional—Casa da Moeda, 1991]. With Macário Santiago Kastner he transcribed various keyboard sonatas published in *Portugaliae Musica*, 38 (1982). Robert Snow supervised his 842-page Ph.D. dissertation completed at the University of Texas in 1990: “The music manuscripts in the Library of King D. João IV of Portugal (1604–1656): A study of Iberian musical repertoire in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries” (DEY 91-16990; *Dissertation Abstracts* 52: 17A [July 1991]).

²¹Planchart, the most renowned South American-born musicologist of his generation (Caracas: July 29, 1935), entered Juan Bautista Plaza’s Escuela Preparatoria de Música at Caracas in its inaugural year, and remained in it during its first decade—“but we were hardly aware that we were, so to speak, guinea pigs in a marvelous educational experiment. Only later did we come to see how thorough, how unusual, and how good a musical training we were given.”

For later hallmarks of Planchart’s career, see the *International Who’s Who in Music and Musicians Directory*, 19th edn., 1994/5, p. 824. The ideal musicologist—because like Pedrell, Barbieri, Adolfo Salazar, and other Spanish-speaking composer-musicologists named in Robert Stevenson’s introduction to Francisco Asenjo Barbieri. *Biografías y Documentos sobre Música y Músicos Españoles (Legado Barbieri)*, Vol. 1, ed. Emilio Casares Rodicio (Madrid: Fundación Banco Exterior, 1986), p. xvii—Planchart conducts, composes, edits, and contributes musicological treasures to all the foremost journals.

María Elizabeth Lucas’s “Directory of Latin American and Caribbean Music Theses and Dissertations (1984–1988),” *LAMR*, x/1 (Spring/Summer 1989), 148–170 (arranged under alphabetized countries) provides useful commentary on each listed item. At the close of *LAMR*, x/2, 325–343, a ten-year cumulative index of the first ten volumes (1980–1989) adds immensely to their usability. *RMCh* provided cumulative indexes (broken down under headings) in no. 129–130 (January–June 1975) for the years of founding in 1945 through 1974; in no. 163 (January–June 1985) for 1975 to 1985, and (thereafter) yearly indexes through 1993 (no. 165 for 1985, 167 for 1986, 169 for 1987, 171 for 1988, 173 for 1989, 175 for 1990, 178 for 1991, 179 for 1992, 181 for 1993). Unlike *LAMR* and *RMCh*, *IAMR* has specialized in offering liberal quantities of ready-to-perform complete musical selections. To accommodate an entire issue devoted to South American colonial delights, *IAMR* increased size to an 8½ × 11-inch format in its Spring–Summer 1985 issue—remaining at that size thereafter. Four numbers of *IAMR* include exhaustive analytical indexes (viii/1 and 2, x/2, and xi/1). The Spring–Summer 1991 issue concluded with the titles of 77 “Dissertations [on] Latin American Topics” accepted by USA universities between 1946 and 1989. Alphabetized by author, each entry specifies page-length, date of fil-



ing, location of abstract, and order-number from University Microfilms.

RMCh performed a nonpareil service by publishing in nos. 177 (January–June 1992) and 178 (July–December 1992) a first-time ever *Bibliografía Musicológica Latinoamericana* of the most detailed annotated type, broken down under: (1) Auxiliares para la investigación; (2) Publicaciones periódicas y obras de autoría múltiple; (3) Musicología histórica; (4) Etnomusicología; (5) Organología; (6) Interpretación y Educación, Notación; (7) Educación musical superior, divulgación; (8) Música y otras artes; (9) Música y disciplinas conexas; and (10) Música y Liturgia. Gerardo Victor Huseby²² (Deán Funes 172, 1876 Bernal, Argentina) served as General Editor. National representatives from nine countries plus Puerto Rico aided in the preparation of this behemoth listing. A cumulative index concluding the bibliography (in no. 178, pp. 53–89) and copious cross-references make the entire enterprise a cynsure. The names of cooperating musical scholars form a Who's Who of musicologists in Spanish-speaking Latin America.

Portuguese-speaking Brazil, not involved in the project, has nonetheless spawned a large school of musicologists, many of whom have more nearly embodied Joseph Kerman's ideals than have archivists travailing in other locales. Albert T. Luper extolled the founding father of Brazilian musical criticism in his article "The Musical Thought of Mário de Andrade (1893–1945)," *Yearbook Inter-American Institute for Musical Research* (Tulane University), 1 (1965), 41–54. An "ugly mulatto"²³ unsuccessful in his first romantic outreach who by choice remained single throughout life, Andrade excelled as a philosopher, a pianist, a poet, and a polymath, whose abundant writings continue today exerting profound influence. Vasco Mariz placed Andrade first among the trinity of Brazilians extolled in *Três musicólogos brasileiros: Mário de Andrade, Renato Almeida, Luiz Heitor Corrêa de*

Azevedo (Rio de Janeiro: Civilização Brasileira, 1983).

Since musical erudition cannot flourish without journals, Corrêa de Azevedo in 1934 founded the *Revista Brasileira de Música (RBM)* as an organ of what was then the Instituto Nacional de Música of the Universidade do Brasil (name changed to Escola de Música of the Universidade Federal do Rio de Janeiro by decree, November 5, 1965). Continuing as editor to 1941, he lifted it to a level that from its first issue won unanimous newspaper praise (*Correio da Manhã* April 11, 1934; *O Globo*, April 12; *O Radical*, April 27) and salute by Francisco Curt Lange "as the best Latin American musical periodical heretofore published."²⁴

Despite so auspicious a beginning, *RBM* in 1944 ceased publication after volume x (plus a special number in 1936 commemorating the centennial of Carlos Gomes's birth). When revived in 1981 with volume xi, the magazine contained a mixture—the historical entries ranging from Dulce Martins Lamas's "O Samba de Escola" and Angelo Camin's "A arte do órgão no Brasil" to Marco Aurélio Caldas Barbosa's "Quem foi o Dr. José Maurício Nunes Garzia."²⁵ Volume xxi (1994–1995), painstakingly edited by Maria de Fátima Granja Tacuchian, contains seven articles, ranging in subject matter from Regis Duprat's "Ramos de Pareja, o grande teórico musical do Pre-renascimento" (pp. 45–49)²⁶ to Maria Alice Volpe's "Compositores românticos brasileiros: estudos na Europa" (pp. 51–76).

²⁴Citations in Maria de Fátima G. Tacuchian, "RBM: Tributo aos Pioneiros," *Revista Brasileira de Música*, xxi (1994/95), page v.

²⁵Baptized October 21, 1808, in São José church at Rio de Janeiro, with the name of José Apolinário, he changed it in 1828 to the name of his father who died April 18, 1830. Supporting himself by organ playing and with relatives' aid, the homonym son became a Doctor of Medicine, a professor of anatomy, and a renowned surgeon. He died October 18, 1884, the only legitimized of the composer's four sons.

²⁶In the preface to his Spanish translation of Ramos's 1482 treatise, Clemente Terni does not specify 1435 as Ramos's birth year, nor 1521 as his death year. Neither does Terni nor any up-to-date lexicon give 1512 as Cristóbal de Morales's birth year and 1540 as Tomás Luis de Victoria's natal year. The lack of current reference works in not only Brazil but in numerous other Latin American nations compromises their scholars' attempts to discourse on European historical topics.

²²For Huseby's summary of his Ph.D. dissertation, "The 'Cantigas de Santa María' and the medieval theory of mode" (Stanford University, 1983; 315 pp.) see *Dissertation Abstracts International*, 43/11A, p. 3451 (order-number DEU 86-14681).

²³To compensate for his unprepossessing appearance, Mariz records that he always dressed meticulously. He adored playing the piano and worshipped Chopin.



Not the sole Brazilian periodical publishing musical scholarship in the 1990's, *RBM* joined forces in 1995 with such other irregularly appearing journals as the following interdisciplinary emissions:

- (1) *Art: revista da Escola de Música e Artes Cênicas* (Universidade Federal da Bahia, Salvador, Bahia); first issue, 1981²⁷
- (2) *ARTEunesp* (São Paulo: Universidade Estadual Paulista), an interdisciplinary annual issued since founding in 1985 by the Instituto de Artes do Planalto [Rua Dom Luiz Lasagna 400, São Paulo 04266] that in Volume 2/4 (1986/88, 143 pp.) contained three articles of musical import, and in Volume 7 (1991, 219 pp.) included five musically significant contributions; Volume 8 (1992, 223 pp.) contained among a total of 18 articles five of musical value
- (3) *Barroco, revista de ensaio e pesquisa* (Universidade Federal de Minas Gerais, Belo Horizonte, Minas Gerais, 1969-).

How dispersed are the journals that contain musicologically significant contributions can be instanced in the writings of only the one author, Francisco Curt Lange. The *Bibliografia da música brasileira 1977-1984*, issued by the Escola de Comunicações e Artes, Serviço de Biblioteca e Documentação, Universidade de São Paulo cooperatively with the Centro Cultural São Paulo, Divisão de Pesquisas, 1988 (275 pp.) lists nine articles, of which four had appeared in foreign periodicals, the five published in Brazil being credited to the *Arquivo Público Mineiro* (1979), *Barroco* (1977), *Conselho Estadual de Cultura* [Belo Horizonte] (1979), and *Revista de História* [São Paulo] (issues 109, pp. 227-269; and 12, pp. 382-435).

Edward A. Riedinger of The Ohio State University, who reviewed the *Bibliografia da música brasileira 1977-1984* in *Fontes artis musicae*, 38/3 (July-September 1991), 242-243, correctly observed that "the establishment of bibliographical control and thus sustained research access to Brazilian music . . . has been lamentably slight." How inadequate the control can be further documented from the review of the same *Bibliografia* in *Inter-American Music Review*, xiii/1 (Fall-Winter 1992), 112. None of the *IAMR* Brazilian coverage beginning with "The Brazilian Bishop who launched the first piano publication (1732)" (i/2, Spring-Summer

1979, pp. 211-215) and continuing with articles and reviews in i/2, 239, 240, 242-244; iii/1, 109, 115-116; iii/2, 203-206; iv/2, 3-30, 87; v/1, 109-116, 117, 121-122, 128; v/2, 63-88, 117-118), prompted any mention whatsoever in the reviewed *Bibliografia*. After *IAMR*, v (1982-1983), Volumes vii/2, 96-103, 104-116, 116-118, 120; viii/2, 99; ix/1, 1-8, 9-10; ix/2, 91-104; xiii/1, 112, 113, 120; xiii/2, iii-iv, 159-160, 162, 162-163, 166-167, 168-170; xiv/1, 157, 169-170; xiv/2, 1-19, 108-109, 112-113, 118; add significantly to Brazilian studies. Although Riedinger's contention (*Fontes* 38/3, p. 243) that Brazilian music is the "richest in Latin America" may not elicit unanimous assent, none will argue that a valid history of Brazilian music in English remains a supreme desideratum.²⁸

Whatever may be said in behalf of a trustworthy history in the English language, Brazil among Latin American nations does boast the best now available dictionary of her national music. In comparison with Rodolfo Arizaga's one-volume *Enciclopedia de la música argentina* (Buenos Aires: Fondo Nacional de las Artes, 1971; 371 pp.) and Helio Orovio's *Diccionario de la música cubana* (Havana: Editorial Letras Cubanas, 1981; 442 pp.), valuable to a certain point though they be, the two-volume *Enciclopedia da música brasileira erudita folclórica popular* published at São Paulo—long the largest city on the continent (10,099,086 population in 1985), by Art Editora in 1977—lacks the illustrations and other blandishments of the four-volume *New Grove Dictionary of American Music* (1986), but in numerous crucial respects, compares most gratifyingly.

VI A TEST CASE: COVERAGE OF "THE FATHER OF BRAZILIAN MUSIC"

Alone among Latin American nations to date, Brazil has honored her musical founding father, the mulatto native of Rio de Janeiro, José Maurício Nunes

²⁸In reviewing David P. Appleby's 209-page *The Music of Brazil* (Austin: University of Texas Press, 1983), Gerard Béhaque discerned its being "a compilation of data coming almost exclusively from secondary sources which Appleby quotes or paraphrases extensively, without verifying, in most instances, the accuracy of these data. . . . [This volume's] unsophistication and its numerous flaws in the long run may actually prove harmful to the tyro in Brazilian music history" (*Notes of the Music Library Association*, 41, September 1984, 47, quoted in *Book Review Digest*, Vol. 80, p. 50).

²⁷Short reviews of articles published in *Art*, 1983, 1984, and 1985 issues, invade *HLAS*, no. 48 (1986), items 7077, 7080, 7081, and 7084.



Garcia (1767–1830), with a 413-page, indexed *Catálogo temático das obras do Padre José Maurício Nunes Garcia*, meticulously compiled by the sometime president of the Sociedade Brasileira de Musicologia, Cleofe Person de Mattos (Rio de Janeiro: Ministério da Educação e Cultura, 1970).²⁹ Following this thematic catalogue, she embarked on what was intended to become the first *opera omnia* edition of a major Latin American composer, each volume being accompanied by a critical bilingual introduction (Portuguese and English). In 1978 she published Garcia's *Matinas do Natal*, his Christmas set of responsories composed in 1799, nine years before the arrival at Rio de Janeiro of the royal court.³⁰ Full orchestral scores of psalms 112 and 116 (*Laudate pueri* and *Laudate Dominum*, for flutes, horns, strings, four-part choir) and of the celebratory graduals *Deus sanctificatus*³¹ and *Justus cum*

²⁹ Barry S. Brook, *Thematic Catalogues in Music, an annotated bibliography* (Hillsdale, New York: Pendragon Press, 1972), p. 187, credits the publication to Gráfica Olímpica Editora Ltda. Mattos itemizes the library locations for each of Garcia's manuscripts, gives extensive biographical and bibliographical information, and at her pages 61–336 provides double-staff incipits for all voices in all sections of 237 works (vocal items with text-underlay).

Too late for Brook's *Thematic Catalogues*, the Pontificia Universidade Católica do Rio de Janeiro sponsored Mattos's 209-page thematic catalogue of 18th-century liturgical works inserted at pages 67–275 in *O ciclo do ouro: o tempo e a música do barroco católico, pesquisa de Elmer C. Corrêa Barbosa* (Rio de Janeiro: Ministério da Educação e Cultura, FUNARTE, Xerox, 1979, 454 pp.). *IAMR*, 3/1 (Fall 1980), 115–116, provided a review.

³⁰ Composed for performance December 25, 1799, the year after Garcia became music director of Rio de Janeiro Cathedral, the eight instrumentally accompanied Christmas responsories for four-part chorus (SATB) and soloists, show how accomplished a composer Garcia had become a decade before arrival of the royal court. They also prove how capable were both singers and instrumentalists in 1799 (date of organ accompanied version) and in 1801 (orchestral version). In conformity with classic era key preferences, every responsory is in major (B flat, F, G, D, G, C, E flat, C [starting in C minor]). Where key shifts occur they are always to the dominant (responsories 1, 2, 5–8). For variety, Garcia relies on meter, tempo, and texture changes. The manuscripts used as sources for the present edition belong to the chapter library of Rio de Janeiro Cathedral.

³¹ *Dies sanctificatus*: gradual para o dia de Natal para coro, orquestra e órgão. Pesquisa e texto de Cleofe Person de Mattos (FUNARTE [Fundação Nacional de Arte], 1981, 48 pp., facsim.)

In her introduction, the editor lists 17 graduals for masses dated 1793 to 1800, and 10 for undated masses. In addition, Garcia wrote graduals for three Requiem Masses dated 1799,

ceciderit followed in 1981.³² Two years later she edited Garcia's earliest extant work, the antiphon *Tota pulchra es Maria*, 1783 (flute, strings, choir). In 1982 she edited the *Ofício dos defuntos*,³³ composed in 1816 to precede his Requiem Mass (soloists, choir, orchestra) and in 1982 and 1984 the *Missa pastoril* for Christmas night, 1811,³⁴ and *Missa de Santa Cecilia*, 1826, the latter his work of largest dimension.³⁵

1809, and 1816, and a half-dozen undated graduals for Holy Week and Easter observances. The 1793 Christmas gradual published at pp. 33–47 in the present edition is a D Major 3/4 work of 96 bars, scored for SATB, two French horns, first and second violins, viola, cello, string bass, and figured organ. Notable among the characteristics of this early work for Rio de Janeiro Cathedral are the dynamic markings, calling for sharp contrasts between loud and soft.

³² *Justus cum ceciderit*: gradual de São Sebastião para coro, soprano solo, orquestra e órgão, Pesquisa e texto de Cleofe Person de Mattos (FUNARTE, 1981; 51 pp.: facsim.).

Composed for the annual celebration of St. Sebastian's feast day (January 20, 1799), this charming D Major 3/4 gradual [score at pp. 33–51] is the only one that survives among many that Garcia wrote honoring Rio de Janeiro's patron saint.

³³ *Ofício dos defuntos*, 1816, para solistas, coro e orquestra. Pesquisa e texto de Cleofe Person de Mattos (FUNARTE, 1982; 196 pp. facsim., table).

The composer's mother, Victoria Maria da Cruz, who was a black [*b* Cachoeira do Campo, Minas Gerais; *d* Rio, March 20, 1816], died the same month as Maria I. The composer's grief was therefore personal. The present *Officium defunctorum* consisting of nine responsories was composed to precede his Requiem Mass (*Catálogo temático*, 185), sung "in the Chapel Royal with extraordinary pomp" during a ceremony sponsored by the Third Carmelite Order in Maria I's memory. The musical quality of the responsories matches that of the Requiem. Orchestral forces include paired clarinets and French horns, plus strings (first and second violins, first and second violas, cello, bass).

³⁴ *Missa pastoril para noite de Natal*, para solistas, coro e orquestra (FUNARTE, 1982; 119 pp., facsim.).

Originally composed in 1808 for SATB soloists and SATB chorus with organ accompaniment, this Christmas Mass was rewritten with orchestra minus violins three years later. The 1811 score calls for paired clarinets, bassoons, French horns, trumpets in B flat, first and second violas, first and second cellos, organ, and timpany. The 6/8 C Major music for the *Kyrie*, *Gratias*, *Cum Sancto Spiritu*, and *Agnus* movements is substantially the same. Solos demand virtuoso operatic singers. *Qui sedes* pits a solo soprano against three harmonizing basses.

³⁵ *Missa de Santa Cecilia*, 1826, para solistas, coro e grande orquestra (FUNARTE, 1984; 371 pp., facsim., table).

In the bilingual [Portuguese and English] introduction, the meticulous editor gives appropriate reasons for considering this work the apex of Garcia's creative achievement. He composed 19 still extant Masses (not counting four Requiem Masses and



The Requiem Mass composed for the exequies of Queen Maria I (d March 9, 1816, at Rio de Janeiro), newly edited with some significant alterations by Dominique-René de Lerma, enters the *Black Composers Series* as Volume 5, recorded in 1975 (Columbia M33431). De Lerma also wrote the only article on Garcia thus far published in a USA learned journal, "The Life and Works of Nunes-Garcia: a status report," *Black Perspective in Music*, xiv/2 (Spring 1986), 93-102. He began by reminding readers that on August 31, 1977, Paul Freeman³⁶ had conducted the New York Philharmonic Orchestra and the Morgan State University Chorus in the first USA performance of Garcia's Requiem. Reviewed by Harold Schonberg in the *New York Times*, September 1, II:11:1, Nunes (not Nuñez, as incorrectly reported by Schonberg) Garcia's work concluded a Celebration of Black Composers subsidized concert that included also José White's³⁷ Violin Concerto in F sharp minor (1864) with Aaron Rosand as soloist. According to Schonberg, Garcia,

a learned man with a big library was able somehow to assimilate the work of contemporary Europeans thousands of miles away. Certainly his D minor Requiem is as good as any of the post-Mozartean works composed in the first decades of the 19th century (the Requiem dates from 1816). It is a solid, occasionally forceful piece

two belonging to Palm Sunday *Oficios*). Among characteristics of this St. Cecilia Mass common to the other Masses: (1) Kyrie and Gloria [234 pp.] are much longer than Credo, Sanctus, and Agnus together [102 pp.]; and (2) Kyrie starts in his favorite key, E flat Major (10 of his 19 Masses start in E flat). The solo movements in the present Mass (Laudamus, Qui tollis, and Quoniam) call for operatic stars. Very evidently, the tenor singer, Cândido Inácio da Silva, who was responsible for commissioning the St. Cecilia Mass premiered November 22, 1826, and who was Garcia's former pupil and himself a celebrated composer of *modinhas*, wanted several virtuosic display numbers. After quickly composing the first version of the Mass (30 days), Garcia spent his last four years revising the orchestration. Because of its monumental proportions, this Mass has defied frequent performances, but becoming better known through adequate interpretations, it would confirm his renown as a great master.

³⁶Born at Richmond, Virginia, January 2, 1936, Paul (Douglas) Freeman is profiled in Eileen Southern's *Biographical Dictionary of Afro-American and African Musicians* (Westport, CT: Greenwood Press, 1982), 138-139, and the *International Who's Who in Music and Musicians' Directory*, 14th edn., 1994/95, 329.

³⁷Concerning White, see Luis Merino, "José White in Chile: National and International Repercussions," *IAMR*, xi/1 (Fall-Winter 1990), 87-112, and Cristina Magaldi, "José White in Brazil, 1879-1888," *IAMR*, xiv/2 (Winter-Spring 1995), 1-19.

that once in a while, as in the "Dies irae," hints at the Romanticism that was beginning to be in the air. Most of the music, however, is solidly rooted in the previous century, and it is written with strength and confidence.

Unaware of the presence with the royal court at Rio de Janeiro of Haydn's "favorite pupil," Sigismund Neukomm, from 1816 to his departure April 15, 1821,³⁸ Schonberg shares with the critics from Baltimore, San Francisco, and Washington, D.C., who also praised Garcia's Requiem, innocence of the Brazilian reality 1808-1821. Nor was he expected to have known that Garcia himself conducted on December 19, 1819, the first performance in South America of Mozart's Requiem, K. 626. Highly lauded by Neukomm in the *Allgemeine musikalische Zeitung* of July 19, 1820 (Vol. xxii, no. 29), columns 501-503, not only for the Mozart premiere but for his other musical excellencies, Garcia had absorbed both Haydn and Mozart.

Garcia's first orchestrally accompanied work published in the United States, his *Lauda Sion Salvatorem* Corpus Christi sequence composed in 1809 (autograph score in the Escola de Música Library, Reg. 30.225), occupies pages 173-201 in the *Latin American Colonial Music Anthology (LACMA)* published by the General Secretariat, Organization of American States (Washington, D.C., 1975). This same sequence (text by Thomas Aquinas) also takes pride of place as the first large-scale Garcia masterpiece recorded in the United States. In the same year that the *LACMA* emerged, Roger Wagner added to his other pioneering feats when he included it in his 48-minute sound disc titled *Festival of Early Latin American Music* (UCLA Latin American Center, Eldorado series 1).

The first to notice the Eldorado No. 1 album and its successor No. 2 (*Latin American Musical Treasures from the Sixteenth, Seventeenth, and Eighteenth Centuries*) was Sharon Girard, Review Editor for Gerard Béhague's *LAMR*, Volumes I through III, no. 1, who in 1/1, 119-121 (Spring-Summer 1980, dedicated to the memory of Charles Seeger) pro-

³⁸Luiz Heitor Corrêa de Azevedo, "Sigismund Neukomm; An Austrian Composer in the New World," *MQ*, xlv/4 (October 1959), 476, incorrectly dated the cited issue of *Allgemeine musikalische Zeitung*, No. 23 (should be June 7, 1820), 401. At page 503 (No. 29, July 19, 1820), Neukomm identifies himself as the correspondent supplying Rio de Janeiro musical news. The Mozart Requiem premiered December 19, 1819, at the Igreja do Parto was preceded by a Davide Perez *Officium defunctorum*.



VII FUTURE PROSPECTS

vided a comprehensive listing of the contents of both albums. She concluded thus: "More records of this level of musicianship and scholarship continue to be needed not only in the musical world but also for the Latin Americanist in related disciplines." Lester D. Brothers followed suit with an even more detailed account of all four albums recorded for the UCLA Eldorado series by Roger Wagner's forces (*LAMR*, v/2 [Fall-Winter 1984]), 293–306. Not to neglect a South American venture, Gerard Béhague—author of the "almost six columns for the 'Garcia, José Mauricio Nunes' entry in *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians* (vol. 7, pp. 152–155)"—perceptively reviewed the two-disc *Album Comemorativo* (Coronado 151 4221356, Instituto Nacional de Música-FUNARTE [Fundação Nacional de Arte]) that had been issued in 1980 to solemnize the sesquicentennial of Garcia's death. With his usual prescience, Béhague challenged FUNARTE for having merely re-cycled previous recordings—that of Garcia's *Missa Pastoril* (1811) "leaving a great deal to be desired." Also, he questioned sending forth an album accompanied by Aylton Escobar's liner notes that frequently are "highly subjective . . . speculative and historically dubious interpretations in literary, almost fiction-like and extravagant terms."

Preoccupied because from 1977 onward Garcia enjoyed what recognition USA critics accorded him solely because as a mulatto he could be classified as a "Black," Cleofe Person de Mattos—who had been the first to advertise the completely European dramatic works by Garcia housed in the Palácio dos Duques de Bragança at Vila Viçosa (Portugal)—published in 1986 "La tradition européenne et la musique de José Mauricio Nunes Garcia," *The Brussels Museum of Musical Instruments Bulletin*, xvi, 211–220. Nonetheless, even she was forced to admit that had not the race card been played, Garcia would today be as ignored in the USA as is Marcos Portugal. As clinching proof, the sole article devoted to him (or another Brazilian antedating Villa-Lobos) published up to 1996 entered the *Black Perspective in Music* (Spring 1986), 93–102, not *JAMS* or any other non-specialist journal. (For that matter, no USA doctoral dissertation emerged before 1996 celebrating any empire Brazilian.)³⁹

On November 17, 1995, "magesterial, awesome" Craig H. Russell offered the Pacific Southwest Chapter of the American Musicological Society meeting at the University of California, Santa Barbara, an insightful address, "Recovering Mexico's Magnificent Choral Traditions." In answer to the question, "Why has Latin American music (especially Mexican) been ignored?" he gave an eight-pronged response. The future of successful musicological endeavor in Latin America depends—in his well-grounded estimate—on (1) overcoming of the bias all too prevalent in USA graduate schools against accepting Spanish and Portuguese as "major languages" (2) embrace by vademecums of the Grout-Palisca type of Iberian area terms such as *verso*, *villancico*, *loa*, *cantada*, *maitines*, *motete* (3) willingness to endure "field work" difficulties in unexplored or only partially explored, Latin American domains (4) escape from the "short piece" syndrome fostered by prevalent anthologies that highlight the miniature at the expense of the grand and large-scale (5) realistic understanding that unguarded treasures signaled in catalogues have attracted shameless thieves and that what was present yesterday may be gone tomorrow (6) jettisoning of the "black legend" still circulating among numerous unenlightened academicians (7) comprehension of the role that nationalism has played in encouraging prejudice against the Spanish colonial past in countries such as Mexico, Cuba, and Peru (8) aesthetic sensibility that permits evaluating a hitherto unknown work on the basis of its inherent musical worth.

In a profoundly meaningful way, Latin America remains during the late twentieth century the last musicological frontier. Led by such intrepid historians as Lester Brothers, Malena Kuss, Cristina Magaldi, Luis Merino, James Radomski, and Robert Snow, future researchers may yet gather treasures as glistening as Atahualpa's gold.

Her article "Music for the Elite: Musical Societies in Imperial Rio de Janeiro." *LAMR*, 16/1 (Spring/Summer 1995), 1–41, drawing on her dissertation, contains valuable data concerning the repertoires favored by local societies and clubs. "The Club do Engenho-Velho . . . regularly included pieces by local composers such as Gomes, Napoleão, Nascimento, and Nepomuceno" (p. 24).

³⁹Cristina Magaldi completed a 486-page UCLA Ph.D. dissertation in 1994, "Concert Life in Rio de Janeiro, 1837–1900."