ANTRSIDAD DE

brary Association, 2d ser., XII, 1 and 4 [Dec., 1954, and Sept., 1955], 25-40, 533-553), drew up a long list of popular works foisted on famous composers. Although he did not mention the "hymn" *a* 4, Jesu dulcis memoria, nor the Missa Dominicalis, printed at pages 1-2 and 5-14 of the Opera omnia, Volume VIII, these two works can be added to Cudworth's already extensive list.

Jesu dulcis memoria was palmed off as Victoria's by the same Joseph Napoléon Ney (1803-1857, eldest son of Marshal Ney) who was also the first to fob off Marc' Antonio Ingegneri's twenty-seven Responsoria as Palestrina's.234 Haberl-who did his own editing and was therefore alive to Palestrina's stylistic traits-sensed at once the improbability that these Responses were really Palestrina's: and in 1892 published them with the remark that they could quite well have been written by any respectable composer of the Roman school as late as 1600. In 1898 he announced discovery of the original Ingegneri imprint of 1588, thus setting at rest any further doubts. But meanwhile, Jesu dulcis memoria still goes the rounds as Victoria's. Even in Grove's Dictionary (5th ed.; 1954), Volume VIII, page 772, it passed unchallenged as Victoria's. As long ago as 1943 Hans von May argued persuasively that it cannot be Victoria's. None of the authenticated works contains a D: (Jesu dulcis memoria, meas. 19) nor an upper dissonant neighbor on the first of two quavers (mm. 8 [tenor], 10 [altus]). Also out of style are the unprepared inverted dominant-seventh chord (meas. 5) and the downward leap of a fourth from a dissonant minim (mm. 8-9). When Victoria introduces diminished fourths in his melodic lines they almost invariably proceed upward, not downward as at mm. 20 and 22 of Jesu dulcis memoria. Also, since the text forms the first strophe of a hymn, we should remember that in his published hymns Victoria sets even, not odd, stanzas.

The Missa Dominicalis was "discovered" by Pedrell, who when he came to publish it committed himself so finally as to declare that *la obra es, indudablemente, de Victoria* (VicO., Vol. VIII, p. xcvii). But Casimiri proved irrefragably in his "Una Missa Dominicalis falsamente attribuita a Tomaso Ludovico de Victoria" (Note d'archivio, X, 3 [July-Sept., 1933], 185-188) that this alternation mass non possa essera di Tommaso Ludovico da Vittoria. In this article he adduced nineteen examples of untypi-

234 PW, Vol. XXXII, page v, note 1.

cal procedures: among them, the upward leap of a major sixth, unprepared sevenths, sevenths and diminished fifths quitted by leap (other than those in changing-note figures), and "booby" consecutives.

## NEED FOR A NEW OPERA OMNIA EDITION

These tokens suggested to Anglés the urgency of a modernized edition to replace Pedrell's.<sup>235</sup> However, his death aborted the Victoria *Opera omnia* started by him in 1965. The need for such an updated complete works edition became all the clearer after 1975, in which year Klaus Fischer published his article, "Unbekannte Kompositionen Victorias in der Biblioteca Nazionale in Rom," *Archiv für Musikwissenschaft*, XXXII/2 (1975), 124–138.

235 Hans von May in his doctoral dissertation, Die Kompositionstechnik T. L. de Victorias (Bern: Paul Haupt, 1943), offered at pages 151-152 a list of thirty-three errors that he had discovered in the Pedrell edition of Victoria's complete works; twenty-one of which were wrong notes, six of which were wrong time values. Even so, the tale was far from complete. Walter Hirschl in "The Styles of Victoria and Palestrina: A Comparative Study, with Special Reference to Dissonance Treatment" (Master's thesis, University of California [Berkeley], 1933), not only anticipated many of May's conclusions by a decade, but also offered an even fuller list of Pedrell's editorial errors. These included the leap of a seventh (VicO, V, 114, mm. 43-44; VII, 10 meas. 141); unprepared sevenths on "strong" beats (VicO, V, 91, meas. 343; 193, meas. 293 [Responsorium 8], VI, 144, meas. 163 [Responsorium]; VIII, 54, meas. 911 [Lectio 3]); dissonant upper auxiliary [minim] quitted by leap (VicO, IV, 18, meas. 1924); upward resolutions of dissonant suspensions (VicO, 11, 80, meas. 212; VIII, 32, meas. 64 [Lectio 2]); use of wrong clefs (VicO, IV, 86, meas. 64; VI, 124, meas. 7; 125, meas. 17; VII, 126, mm. 122, 124; VIII, 52, meas. 59); and other miscellaneous impossibilities (VicO, II, 74, mm. 42, 502; 111, 78, meas. 764; IV, 55, meas. 712; 106, meas. 583; V, 115, meas. 754; 116, meas. 89; 118, meas. 165; 149, meas. 9; 154, meas. 26; VI, 42, meas. 524; VII, 126, meas. 1234; 154, meas. 47). Hirschl also took issue with Pedrell's careless and usually incorrect transcription of Victoria's triple-meter signatures (p. 105). With equal justification he might have impugned Pedrell's carelessness in distinguishing between Victoria's C and C signatures.

Working with no other data than that supplied by Pedrell, Hirschl concluded that Victoria "acquired or developed a much more modern and appreciative attitude towards the effect of minor triads, both as initial and final chords of compositions than had his contemporary, Palestrina" (p. 8). Victoria, for instance, began no less than twenty-six times with a full minor triad. Considering the fact that Palestrina scarcely ever began full, Victoria's having begun full so many times with a minor INTER-AMIC CAN MUSIC REVIEW

In it, Fischer called attention to Mss. Musicali 130 at the Biblioteca Nazionale Centrale Vittorio Emanuele II (Rome). This sixteenth-century choirbook. copied presumably between 1592 and 1595, contains ten four-voice psalms. Above the alto part at the beginning of each psalm appears the name of "Thome Ludovici de Victoria" as composer. (Seven of the ten were placed in score by Fortunato Santini and are now catalogued Samt. Hs. 1218 in the Bibliothek des Bischöflichen Priesterseminars at Münster/W.) The ten vesper psalms in Mss. Musicali 130 at the National Library in Rome proceed in this order: 109, Tone I, odd-verse; 110, Tone IV, odd-verse; 111, Tone VIII, even-verse; 112, Tone VI, even-verse; 116, Tone III, even-verse; 117, Tone VII, odd-verse; 110, Tone IV, even-verse, equal voices; 111, Tone VIII, odd-verse, equal voices; 126, Tone VI, oddverse, equal voices; 115, Tone VI, odd-verse.

Palestrina not infrequently wrote an accented dotted minim followed by an upward leap to a crotchet (Jeppesen [1927], pp. 59-60). Victoria used such a figure only four times (*VicO*, I, 16, meas. 72; 111, 33, meas. 53; 48, meas. 35; 1V, 34, meas. 46). Palestrina preferred, if at all possible, that the third voice part should fill out a triad at its moment of entry. Victoria "does not seem to attach as much importance to having the third voice fill out the triad as does Palestrina" (Hirschl, p. 26). Instead, Victoria seems often content to bring in the third voice "against a suspended-note, allowing the resolution of the suspension" to fill out the triad; or to assign it merely the role of duplicating a note in the two other voice parts. Victoria "probably felt [in such instances] that the imitation was of too much importance to be broken for the sole purpose of filling out a triad" (p. 32).

Palestrina and Victoria also differ in their attitude toward dissonance on the third crotchet of a descending four-note series (beginning on a strong beat). In Palestrina, "after a descending progression of four tones, the voice [frequently] moves up the degree of a second" (Jeppesen [1927], p. 112). This particular descending figure of four crotchets followed by a stepwise turn upward to a minim or semibreve, with the third of the four crotchets a dissonance, hardly ever occurs in Victoria—frequently though it appears in the works in Palestrina. For Victoria's isolated uses see *VicO*, I, 74, meas. 40; 94, mm. 91<sub>2</sub>, 95<sub>4</sub>; II, 33, meas. 26<sub>2</sub>.

Victoria, even when writing chordally, occasionally introduces dissonances of minim value. "The most striking thing about All ten were eminently suitable for small choirs of modest abilities, and are plainsong-based. The first eight open with a plainchant half-verse enunciating the Gregorian psalm-tone (A is the *tuba*. in Tone IV, C in Tone VIII). Victoria's fastidiousness comes to light in his handwritten plea to Francisco Soto de Langa, his colleague at the Oratory in Rome in charge of shepherding these ten psalms through the press, begging him to see that great care be taken in the matter of word-placement. Victoria also exercised his usual care with accidentals (specifying constant G<sup>#</sup>'s in Tone IV psalms).

However, no printed copy has thus far surfaced. Therefore it is to be presumed that the collection was never published. Such works as these ten psalms, not to mention again the various motets from manuscript sources published at Madrid by Samuel Rubio in his two-volume Antología polifónica sacra (1954,

If the study of Victoria's works, based on no more than the Pedrell edition, has yielded such interesting stylistic discoveries as the above, it is not to be doubted that at some future date even more acute style distinctions can begin to be made. Although Victoria may never be shown to have called for  $D_{\#}$ 's, or for such rhythms as **f b** and **fff** with minims as tactus, or to have indulged in melodies founded on triads, or in plentiful sequences and repetitions, both melodic and harmonic, or to have used chromaticisms for expressive purposes—all of which features distinguish, for instance, Lassus's motet style—he can already, on the basis of present knowledge, be shown to have developed a detail technique that, properly understood, contrasts with Palestrinian mannerism.

Among the advantages to be gained from such a surer understanding of Victoria's special traits will be a canon not only purified of the spurious *Jesu dulcis memoria* and *Missa dominicalis*, but also a canon at the same time enriched with such hitherto unknown motets as the three published by P. Samuel Rubio in his *Antología polifínica sacra*, Volumes I (1954) and II (1956)— *Ego sum panis vivus* (1, 287-293), *Beata es Virgo* (II, 61-70), and *Beati immaculati* (II, 328-332).

Eugene C. Cramer still further enlarged the Victoria canon when he announced the discovery of two motets in Italian manuscript miscellanies: *Date ei de fructu, a 4*, at Florence in the Biblioteca del Conservatorio di Musica "Luigi Cherubini," E. 117 (*Motetti a piu voci di diversi autori*, no. 26), and *Vidi speciosam, a 8*, at Rome, in the Biblioteca Casanatense MS 2295, no. 6. See The New Grove High Renaissance Masters (London: Macmillan, 1984), pp. 315, 316.

triad seemed especially significant to Hirschl. He also found instances of minor triads before a double-bar in several of Victoria's masses. Hirschl next pointed to the fact that whereas Jeppesen was able to explain all Palestrina's apparent chromaticisms either as misprints or as dead intervals, Victoria occasionally used chromaticisms that cannot be explained away on either ground (p. 9). Hirschl also pointed to Victoria's now wellknown predilection for the diminished upward fourth as a melodic interval (p. 13): Palestrina having never, seemingly, used such an interval.

most [of such minim dissonances] is that they form either dissonant triads or seventh chords which are then properly resolved. This would indicate that Victoria might have had a more intimate knowledge of what could be termed 'later harmonic technique' than is ordinarily supposed'' (Hirschl, pp. 55-56). Victoria seems even to have known how to use the so-called Italian augmented-sixth chord according to rules of part writing which baroque composers were later to observe.

1956) and in his 1964 critical edition of Victoria's motets<sup>236</sup> (plus the two additional motets found by E. C. Cramer), now amply justify continuing Anglés's aborted *Opera omnia*.

The composer who according to Gilbert Chase is matched only by Palestrina as the supreme master of religious polyphonic music; whom Gustave Reese classes as one of the great masters of the Late Renaissance; who, according to Paul Henry Lang, spoke with a "dramatic expressiveness that is without parallel in purely choral literature";<sup>237</sup> and whom encyclopedists from Tovey to Slonimsky have unanimously called the "crown" of the Spanish school and voted the "greatest of Spanish composers"; deserves such a tribute.

## CATALOGUE OF VICTORIA'S WORKS

Until such a desired new critical complete works edition becomes available, the following short-title catalogue is here given of his works published in Felipe Pedrell's *Opera omnia* (Leipzig: Breitkopf und Härtel, 1902–1913; facsimile reprint by Gregg Press, 1965) [P]; in Samuel Rubio's *Motetes* (Madrid: Unión Musical Española, 1964; based chiefly on the 1603 re-edition of the 1583 *Motecta*, with variants annotated and with seven motets from MS sources) [R]; and in Higinio Anglés's aborted *Opera omnia* (Barcelona: Instituto Español de Musicología, 1965– 1968 [MME, XXV, XXVI, XXX, XXXI]) [A].

Except for infrequent manuscript sources duly specified, all works published by these three editors were transcribed from editions published during Victoria's lifetime. In chronological order, these editions (always published at Rome, unless otherwise stated) can be thus summarized (most words in the titles are lower-cased, and no title is given a diplomatic transcript; org [organ] parts appear solely in the 1600 Madrid miscellany; all polychoral items first published in 1600 include an organ part):

<sup>236</sup> P. Samuel Rubio Calzón, O.S.A., first president of the Sociedad Española de Musicología (1978-1984) and in 1978 founding editor of the SEM's *Revista de Musicología*, died at Madrid March 15, 1986, without being able to carry to completion the critical edition of Victoria's complete works contemplated by him three decades earlier.

<sup>237</sup> Music in Western Civilization (New York: Norton, 1941), p. 268.

## THOMA. LVDOVICI DE VICTORIA: ABVLENSIS. MOTECTA

RSIDAD DA

Tomás Luis de Victoria (cu. 1548-1611)

QVE PARTIM, QVATERNIS, PARTIM, QVINIS, ALIA, SENIS, ALIA, Odosis Vocibus Concinentur.



Title page of *cantus*, first edition of Victoria's motets (Venice: Antonio Gardano's Sons, 1572).



Title page of Victoria's *Liber primus. qui missas, psalmos, magnificat*... (Venice: Angelo Gardano, 1576).